



## A portrait of electronic ticketing effectiveness from the perspective of law enforcement officers in Malang City

Shalahuddin Al Ayyubi\*, Leni Dwi Nurmala, Nahdiya Sabrina

Faculty of Law, University of Merdeka Malang, Malang, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Shalahuddin Al Ayyubi

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.66856/ijl.2026.12.2.12186>

### Abstract

Since 2021, the Indonesian National Police has made an innovative breakthrough by implementing an electronic ticketing system to address various problems arising from conventional ticketing practices, such as extortion, bureaucratic inefficiency, and low transparency in traffic law enforcement. This article aims to examine the effectiveness of electronic ticketing by law enforcement in Malang City, considering that the number of vehicles in the city continues to increase over time. This study employs empirical legal research methods with a legislative and sociological approach. Data collection was conducted through interviews with three personnel from the Malang City Police to obtain empirical data regarding the implementation of electronic ticketing. The results show that the implementation of electronic ticketing by law enforcement in Malang City is still relatively ineffective. Although this system was designed to address the challenges of conventional ticketing, its implementation has actually created various new problems that are difficult to overcome, such as low legal awareness from the public and weak vehicle identification processes because some vehicle owners have not changed ownership or deliberately have not installed license plates. This weak law enforcement process is primarily due to the lack of facilities and infrastructure for implementing electronic ticketing. Thus, the effectiveness of electronic ticketing does not only depend on the sophistication of technology, but also requires the support of public awareness, orderly vehicle administration, and the readiness of law enforcement facilities and institutions.

**Keywords:** Effectiveness, electronic ticketing, law enforcement, Malang City

### Introduction

As a law enforcement agency, the Indonesian National Police, through the Indonesian Traffic Corps, has made an innovation in managing traffic by implementing the Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) system to modernize the ticketing system by giving an electronic ticket to those who violate traffic law. This innovation is intended to provide a more sophisticated and systematic form of traffic oversight<sup>[1]</sup>. This electronic system is a form of modern law enforcement that utilizes surveillance cameras (CCTV) integrated with a motor vehicle registration database to automatically detect violations. Regulations regarding ETLE are written in Law Number 22 of 2009 concerning Traffic and Road Transportation, specifically in article 272 paragraphs (1) and (2), stating "law enforcement on traffic violation activities can use electronic devices, and these electronic devices can also be used as evidence in court." The implementation of electronic ticketing aims to increase transparency, accountability, and effectiveness of law enforcement, while minimizing direct interaction between officers and public that may have the potential to cause any forms of deviation<sup>[2]</sup>.

The implementation of electronic ticketing has been enforced in Malang City, East Java, since 2022 and is expected to be a strategic step in improving public compliance with the law. As the agency responsible for traffic law enforcement, the Malang City Police plays a crucial role in implementing this system. In line with this, the Malang City Police have implemented traffic law enforcement through electronic ticketing without involving direct interaction between officers and public. This system

is intended to ensure that the electronic ticketing system can be used in accordance with its primary objectives, namely increasing transparency and accountability in law enforcement, as well as reducing and preventing the practice of extortion that has happened multiple times from the practice of conventional ticketing<sup>[3]</sup>. So far, stationary and mobile cameras have been installed at several intersections in Malang City. This system is designed to automatically detect violations through surveillance cameras integrated with vehicle registration data, thereby reducing reliance on police officers and, hopefully, increasing objectivity in enforcement.

The development of electronic ticketing is fundamentally a necessity to address the challenges of the times, given the significant increase in land transportation, especially in recent years. Data from the Central Statistics Agency of the Republic of Indonesia shows that in 2024, the total number of motorized vehicles reached 166,465,914<sup>[4]</sup>. This situation can be observed in developing cities in Indonesia, such as Malang City, which is currently experiencing rapid social, economic, and urbanization dynamics. However, the increase in the number of vehicles does not match the capacity of road infrastructure, resulting in various traffic problems, such as congestion, rising rates of traffic violations, along with the risk of accidents. The implementation of electronic ticketing through the installation of static cameras at various strategic places in Malang City and the installation of ETLE Mobile cameras on traffic police patrol cars is expected to improve enforcement of violations detected through the ETLE system. This system is expected to expand the scope of supervision.

The primary goal of implementing electronic ticketing through the ETLE system is mainly to create a more stable and structured traffic monitoring system. However, the effectiveness of this technological development requires further study to obtain a picture of the reality of its implementation. Therefore, this article aims to examine the effectiveness of electronic ticketing from the perspective of law enforcement, namely the Malang City Police. Interviews with law enforcement officers will be conducted to obtain primary data for this article's study. From this study, we will identify the obstacles and challenges encountered in the practice of implementing electronic tickets by police officers. Based on the data obtained, a legal analysis will be conducted based on applicable laws and regulations to create strong legal arguments in response to the obstacles to electronic ticketing implementation in Malang City. Bahauddin also added that the role of the police after the implementation of electronic ticketing has brought about significant changes in the scope of traffic supervision. The role of the police has experienced significant changes between before and after the implementation of electronic ticketing. After the implementation of electronic ticketing, the police experienced a decrease in the intensity of enforcement of conventional traffic violations, with the percentage of conventional enforcement only around 20%. The police only carry out enforcement actions a few times to handle violations that are not detected by the electronic ticketing system, such as drivers who do not display license plates and other equipment, as well as enforcement against illegal racing.

## Research Method

This article employs an empirical legal research method with a statutory and sociological approach. The empirical research method is used to examine legal phenomena as a social behavior that occurs in a community as it is <sup>[5]</sup>. Through this research, the study is conducted not only from the normative legal aspect of traffic law enforcement, but also from an empirical aspect that focuses on the level of legal awareness of law enforcement officers, as well as the implementation of policy enforcement by the Police. This research was conducted using interview techniques with three personnel from the Malang City Police Traffic Unit as samples to obtain data related to the problems raised in this article as a material for analysis.

## Results and Discussion

### 1. Electronic Ticketing as a Traffic Law Enforcement Mechanism in Malang City

Normatively, a ticket is used as proof of violation in a traffic violation system designed to impose sanctions on drivers who violate traffic regulations and are caught red-handed by Traffic Police officers after committing the violation. Before the electronic ticketing system, tickets were issued directly by the police on duty to drivers who committed the violation <sup>[6]</sup>. With the existence of an electronic ticketing mechanism, violators caught violating by CCTV will be notified via email or given a warning letter directly to the violator's home <sup>[7]</sup>. The police, as the party authorized to issue tickets to traffic violators, have a strong legal basis, especially in Article 260 paragraph (1) letter (e) of Law No. 22 of 2009 concerning Traffic and Road Transportation, stating "in the case of taking action against violations and investigating

criminal acts, the investigators of the Republic of Indonesia National Police...in the field of Traffic and Road Transportation are authorized...(e) to take action against criminal acts of violations or traffic crimes according to the provisions of laws and regulations."

The implementation of electronic ticketing is primarily intended as a response to the conventional practice of issuing tickets, which has been proven to cause several problems. Conventional ticketing practices carry a high risk of abuse of authority, such as extortion, lengthy bureaucratic processes, and face-to-face interactions that often trigger arguments on the street. This system also relies heavily on the physical presence of officers. Based on these frequently occurring problems, the application of electronic ticketing should be able to simplify the process of bureaucracy in the ticketing process of ticketing for both law enforcement and the public <sup>[8]</sup>.

Based on Government Regulation No. 80 of 2012, Article 1, number 2 reiterates that the police are the party authorized to act against traffic violators. In addition to being the party that enforces the law against traffic violators, the police also have a role in educating the public regarding policies that must be obeyed while driving <sup>[9]</sup>. This makes the role of the police as law enforcers not only as enforcement officers, but also as educators to the public.

To obtain data related to the implementation of electronic ticketing in Malang City based on positive law, interviews were conducted with three police personnel, including:

- a. Sutrisno, as The First Police Assistant Inspector
- b. Adi Candra Wijatmiko, as The Second Police Assistant Inspector
- c. Achmad Ilham Bahauddin, as Police Brigadier

Sutrisno stated that in Malang City, electronic ticketing has been implemented since 2022. The purpose of implementing electronic ticketing itself is essentially in line with its general objective, namely to simplify the bureaucratic process for issuing tickets for traffic violators and create a more objective and transparent law enforcement. This system has taken place considering that in Malang City several complaints regarding conventional ticketing have been made by the public, due to activities that were done by law enforcers such as extortion. To regain public trust, the use of electronic ticketing will be developed in a better way in the future, while conventional ticketing will be minimized.

Bahauddin also added that the role of the police after the implementation of electronic ticketing has brought about significant changes in the scope of traffic supervision. The role of the police has experienced significant changes before and after the implementation of electronic ticketing. After the implementation of electronic ticketing, the police experienced a decrease in the intensity of enforcement of conventional traffic violations, with the percentage of conventional enforcement only around 20%. The police only carry out enforcement actions a few times to handle violations that are not detected by the electronic ticketing system, such as drivers who do not display license plates and other equipment, as well as enforcement against illegal racing.

In general, the implementation of electronic ticketing is intended as an effort to increase public trust by minimizing the practice of extortion, supported by the use of CCTV as a monitoring tool in areas that have implemented electronic

ticketing <sup>[10]</sup>. Information obtained from the police also supports that the implementation of electronic ticketing in Malang City, in particular, increases public trust and makes the public more alert when driving because of the surveillance via CCTV where data on violations directly enters the data server of the Malang City Police electronic ticketing operator. However, the implementation of electronic ticketing is far from perfect. There are still various obstacles encountered in its implementation, especially by the police.

## 2. Obstacles in Applying Electronic Ticketing as Traffic Supervision

The implementation of electronic ticketing in Malang City has previously been explained normatively. However, the implementation of this technology also faces several obstacles, as revealed by the Malang City Police Traffic Unit. Based on interviews with police officers, Wijatmiko stated that some of the main obstacles faced by the Malang City Police regarding the implementation of electronic ticketing are:

- a. Low public awareness of the electronic ticketing monitoring system. Public still adheres to the concept of conventional ticketing, where people will only comply with driving regulations if there is a traffic operation being held by the police. However, with the implementation of electronic ticketing, police do not need to be on the streets to monitor traffic violations to be able to impose sanctions on violators. Because the public is still unfamiliar with the concept of electronic ticketing, the number of violations remains quite high and is less effective in creating a deterrent effect against violations.
- b. Some violators who received traffic tickets are yet to change the data of the ownership of the vehicle at the vehicle registration office in accordance with their current ownership data. Traffic ticket notifications are issued based on the vehicle owner's name, based on the number shown on the license plate. The problem is, some drivers often use vehicles that are not registered under their own name, but under the name of the previous owner. Therefore, the party who receives the ticket is the previous owner who had already sold the vehicle.
- c. Some drivers don't display license plates on their vehicles. One of the difficulties police face in implementing electronic ticketing is that if a driver doesn't display a license plate, it's difficult to identify the violator. This is different from conventional ticketing, where those who don't display a license plate are subject to immediate sanctions. Not displaying a license plate should also be considered a traffic violation that can result in a ticket. Without a license plate, the police cannot issue a ticket to the offender because they cannot be identified.
- d. The limited facilities and infrastructure needed for the implementation of electronic ticketing. In Malang City, there are only 5 (five) CCTV cameras and 2 (two) INCAR (Integrated Node Capture Attitude Record) cars available as tools for monitoring traffic. However, of the 5 CCTV cameras installed in Malang City, only 3 are functioning, and of the 2 INCAR cars, only 1 is functioning. The number of active devices is not commensurate with the amount of intersections in

Malang City, thus affecting the effectiveness of law enforcement. Inactive CCTV cameras usually only display flashes to drivers without storing data.

Various obstacles faced by the police demonstrate that even sophisticated technology still has its drawbacks. However, these weaknesses should not hinder technological development to create a more conducive law enforcement climate in the future. Given that the implementation of electronic ticketing has also been proven to minimize illegal practices, the implementation of electronic ticketing must be further improved, particularly in terms of infrastructure and oversight <sup>[11]</sup>.

## 3. Theoretical Analysis of Electronic Ticketing as a Criminal Sanction for Traffic Violators

Problems arising from the implementation of electronic ticketing are essentially a sign of ineffective law enforcement. To examine the effectiveness of law enforcement in a deeper sense, the theory of legal effectiveness by a prominent Indonesian scholar, Soerjono Soekanto, will serve as a relevant analytical tool in this article.

Soekanto explains that the success of a law in regulating the life of society is influenced by five main factors, namely: 1) the legal substance; 2) the law enforcement; 3) the means or facilities; 4) the society; 5) and the culture. In this perspective, law is not understood solely as a formal written norm, but also as a social instrument whose effectiveness in its application is dependent on the quality of the legal substance, the professionalism of law enforcement officers, the availability of supporting facilities, the level of legal awareness of society, and the suitability of the law to the cultural values of a particular society <sup>[12]</sup>. Therefore, the effectiveness of the law can be achieved if there is a harmonious synergy between these five factors so that the law is able to function optimally in creating order, justice, and legal certainty in the midst of social life.

Following Soekanto's framework, legal substance is the first thing that must be considered in assessing the effectiveness or ineffectiveness of law enforcement in society <sup>[13]</sup>. Substantively, regulations regarding ticketing for drivers who commit traffic violations have been clearly regulated. Law No. 22 of 2009 in Article 106 has shown some criteria for what can be considered as traffic violations. From the law enforcement factor itself, Article 260 clearly states that the police are the party that has the legal legitimacy to issue tickets to violators. Electronic ticketing itself is implemented with the aim of simplifying the law enforcement process, which will simplify the bureaucratic process for both violators and the police, as law enforcers. Furthermore, the infrastructure related to electronic ticketing must be constantly improved, considering that the lack of equipment to administer electronic tickets poses a challenge for the effectiveness of the system. As previously explained, in Malang City, the disparity between the number of facilities and the need for supervision at intersections for electronic ticketing has been proven to significantly impact the effectiveness of the law enforcement process. The use of technology must be carefully planned and executed to minimize any potential errors.

The effectiveness of electronic ticketing law enforcement is not solely determined by the performance of law enforcement officers, but is also influenced by the level of

public legal awareness in complying with traffic regulations. From a sociological perspective, the public plays an important role as both the subject and object of law enforcement in public spaces. Public awareness to voluntarily comply with traffic regulations can encourage the creation of a legal culture that is oriented towards collective safety in an order way. Conversely, low legal awareness will hinder the effectiveness of electronic ticketing law enforcement even if supported by sophisticated technology and monitoring systems <sup>[14]</sup>. Therefore, the success of an electronic ticketing system requires a synergistic relationship between law enforcement officers and active public participation. In addition, the laws implemented must also consider the values, customs, and culture that exist within the community so that the regulations can be accepted and implemented effectively. Thus, the alignment between the substance of the law and community culture is an important factor in realizing the effectiveness of electronic ticketing law enforcement.

### Conclusion

This article concludes that the effectiveness of electronic ticketing in Malang City can still be considered as less-effective in supporting traffic law enforcement. Various technical and social obstacles remain major obstacles to its implementation in society. Low public legal awareness regarding compliance with traffic regulations indicates that a culture of orderly legal compliance has not yet been optimally developed. Furthermore, many drivers are still yet to change the data of ownership and some of them tend to not display license plates, making the identification of violators difficult. From the perspective of law enforcement officials themselves, major problems remain, such as a lack of facilities and infrastructure that hinder the optimization of the electronic ticketing system. However, the provisions regarding electronic ticketing are clearly regulated in existing laws and regulations. Therefore, although electronic ticketing is essentially designed to simplify law enforcement bureaucracy and address the weaknesses of conventional ticketing, its implementation still requires improvements in some aspects, such as public awareness, vehicle administration, and development in law enforcement facilities.

### References

1. Sultan SJ, Monica NW, Sardika YR. Implementation of Mobile ETLE in Handling Traffic Violations by Two-Wheeler Riders in Blitar City Police Office. *Tanggong Kosala*,2024;13(2):133-143. <https://doi.org/10.70526/tk.v13i2.1668>.
2. Edward M. Police Law in Indonesia: The Journey of Electronic Traffic Law. *Journal International of Officium Nobile*,2025;1(1):31-39.
3. Fatmawati, Rusliadi, Dianti EA, Nanda PN, Subaedah. Evaluation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in Improving Traffic Compliance in Makassar City. *Journal of Cultural Analysis and Social Change*,2025;10(3):1500-1510. <https://doi.org/10.64753/jcasc.v10i3.2624>.
4. Kepolisian RI. Perkembangan Jumlah Kendaraan Bermotor menurut Jenis (Unit), 2024. Badan Pusat Statistik. [Online]. Available, 2025. <https://www.bps.go.id/id/statistics-table/2/NTcjMg==/perkembangan-jumlah-kendaraan-bermotor-menurut-jenis.html>.
5. Eka NAMS, Cynthia H. Penelitian Hukum. Setara Press, Malang, 2022.
6. Devi A, Said L. Digitalization in the Implementation of E-Tickets in Ambon City. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi Pattimura*,2024;3(2):573-584. <https://doi.org/10.30598/JIKPvol3iss2pp573-584>.
7. Audita AP, Yahman. Effectiveness of the Mobile Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in Prosecuting Traffic Violations in the Jurisdiction of the East Java Regional Police Force. *Ius Positum: Journal of Law Theory and Law Enforcement*,2025;4(1):36-49. <https://doi.org/10.56943/jlte.v4i1.741>.
8. Yohanes ADT, Tatok S, Armunanto H. Penegakan Hukum Lalu Lintas melalui e-Tilang dalam Meningkatkan Kesadaran Hukum Berlalu Lintas Studi Kasus Kepolisian Negara Republik Indonesia Resor Badung Bali. *Journal Syntax Idea*,2024;6(5):2106-2118. <https://doi.org/10.46799/syntax-idea.v6i5.3255>.
9. I Putu SM. Penerapan E-Tilang bagi Pelanggar Lalu Lintas di Wilayah Hukum Polda Bali. *Kerta Dyatmika*,2024;21(1):1-11. <https://doi.org/10.46650/kd.v21i1.1470>.
10. Arlin AKT, Dian EI, Mohamad RM. Optimalisasi E-Tilang dalam Inovasi Digital untuk Meningkatkan Kesadaran Hukum dan Ketertiban Lalu Lintas. *Sinergi: Jurnal Riset Ilmiah*,2025;2(1):173-190. <https://doi.org/10.62335/p1xndm75>.
11. Hafidz N, Zahwa O, Rizal A. Evaluating Effectiveness of ETLE and Designing Acts Integration for Traffic Violation Reduction in Magelang Regency. *Journal of Railway Transportation and Technology*, Volume 4, Issue 2, Pages 19-26. <https://doi.org/10.52920/jttl.v6i1.411>.
12. Arya DH, Nur MK, Sri NMK. Efektivitas Penerapan Sistem E-Court dalam Penyelesaian Perkara Cerai Gugat di Pengadilan Agama Suwawa Ditinjau dari Teori Efektivitas Hukum Soerjono Soekanto. *Journal Presumption of Law*, Volume 8, Issue 1, Pages 30-44. <https://doi.org/10.31949/jpl.v8i1.17663>.
13. Aminatol M, Syabbul B. The Implementation of Single-Judge Trials at the Lumajang Religious Court from the Perspective of Soerjono Soekanto's Legal Effectiveness Theory (Based on Supreme Court Decision no. 215/KMA/HK2.6/XI/2024). *Priviet Social Sciences Journal*,2025;5(12):323-335. <https://doi.org/10.55942/pssj.v5i12.1251>.
14. Afnaini, Hamdan. The Role of Legal Sociology in Understanding the Dynamics of Law Enforcement in Society. *Jurnal Restorasi: Hukum dan Politik*,2026;4(1):1-7.